AOC-CR-219, Rev. 1/23 © 2023 Administrative Office of the Courts	or under No. I is filed in the original criminal vr No. II is either a Miscellaneous or slisposition; see Rule of Recordkeeping 16. shes a new CR/CRS case if prosecuted as in the existing case file if disposed as civil IV or V establishes a new CR/CRS case in	County Of Department/Agency	Department Or Agency	pe or print)	Data Received   Data Served   Time Served   Nate Returned	with a copy of this Order.  Defendant/contemnor WAS NOT served for the following	RETURN OF SERVICE  I certify that this Order was received and served as follows:  By personally serving the defendant/contemnor named above	THE STATE OF THE S	Name And Address Of Moving Party If Not The Court	urity No.	Race Sex Date Of Birth Age W M	County Of Residence Telephone No.  Moore 9107225000	102 Monroe Street Carthage, NC 28327	Name And Address Of Defendent/Contemnor Todd Maness Clerk of Court	STATE VERSUS/IN THE MATTER OF	APPEAR PURSUANT TO CRIMINAL SUMMONS, OR FOR CONTEMPT	SHOW CAUSE ORDER, FINDINGS AND JUDGMENT - FAILURE TO PAY FINE AND/OR	File NO DECRES )
(Over)	Count Date   Count Time   Cou	You are ORDERED to appear before the Court as indicated below and show cause why you should not be punished for contempt or for failure to comply with the Court's order as described above. If you do not appear, the Court may issue an order for your arrest or may enter other sanctions against you in your absence.		Act of criminal Contempt [G.S. 5A-11; G.S. 15A-1344(e1)]  Act of criminal contempt described below: (NOTE TO COURT: The grounds provided in G.S. 5A-11(a) are exclusive.)  The undersigned also moves pursuant to NCGS 5A-11(a)(1), (2), (3), (6), and (7). See attachment.	Date Summons Served Date Of Failure To Appear Offense(s)	Date Summons Issued File Number County Name Of Official Who Issued Summons	IV.Failure To Obey Order To Appear Pursuant To Criminal Summons [G.S. 15A-303(e)(3), G.S. 5A:11] Failure to appear before this Court as directed by a criminal summons issued and duly served on you, ordering you to appear before this Court and answer to the offense(s) indicated below:	See attached document for an outline of the allegations of contempt		Date Of Order  File Number  County  Name Of Official Who Enlered Order  Honorable Beth Tanner	IXI.Failure To Obey Other Order Of The Court [G.S. 5A-11; G.S. 5A-21] Fallure to obey the order of the Court indicated below:	II. Failure To Obey Jury Summons [G.S. 9-13]  Failure to report for jury duty as directed pursuant to a jury summons issued on (date)	## Amount Of Fine And/Or Costs Ordered Paid  ### Balance Due As Of The Date Of This Order  ### Salance Due As Of The Date Of This Order  #### Salance Due As Of The Date Of This Order	imprisoned for your failure to pay the fine and/or costs. The amount of the fine and/or costs that you were ordered to pay and the balance due as of the date of this Order are as follows:	☐ I. Failure To Pay Fine And/Or Costs [G.S. 15A-1364]  Failure to pay the fine and/or costs as ordered in this case. The Court will conduct a hearing and decide whether you chould be	To the Defendant/Contemnor Named To The Left: Upon motion of the moving party named herein or on its own motion, the Court finds probable cause to believe that you should be held in contempt of court or fined for your:	In The General Court Of Justice County ☑ District ☐ Superior Court Division ☐ Before The Clerk	STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA

Attorney For State/Moving Party	FINDINGS
Attorney For Defendant/Contemnor	The defendant/contemnor having appeared not appeared before the Court, the Court makes the following findings:  Contempt. G.S. Chapter 5A. (NOTE: The Court may not find both civil and criminal contempt for the same conduct. G.S. 5A-12(d), 5A-21(c), and 5A-23(q),)
☐ Def. Not Indigent ☐ Waived ☐ Appointed ☐ Retained	that the defendant/contemnor is not in criminal or civil contempt.  that the defendant/contemnor is in criminal civil contempt of court, based on the Court's findings of fact beyond a reasonable doubt and conclusions of law herein: (attach additional pages if processed)
APPEAL ENTRIES - CRIMINAL CONTEMPT	1
NOTE TO COURT: If finding of contempt was made by a judicial official inferior to a Superior Court Judge, the appeal is to Superior Court. G.S. 5A-17. On appeal from criminal contempt imposing confinement, there must be a bail hearing "within a reasonable time period" after confinement is imposed. The contempor may not be confined more than 24 hours without a bail hearing. See G.S. 5A-17th for officials who may context the hearing.	7. Failure To Obey Jury Summons. G.S. 9-13.
The defendant/contemnor gives notice of appeal from the judgment of the District Court to the Superior Court.	Fallure To Pay Fine And/Or Costs. G.S. 15A-1364.  that the defendant has defaulted in payment of the fine and/or costs imposed in this case, for which defendant had the ability to comply or failed to make a good faith effort to obtain the necessary funds for payment.  Other:
	JUDGMENT
	Dismissal. All proceedings pursuant to this Show Cause Order are dismissed.  Criminal Contempt. G.S. 5A-12. It is ORDERED that the defendant: (check all that apply)  NOTE TO COURT: If suspending a sentence for contempt, impose judgment on form AOC-CR-604.  1. is hereby censured for contempt.
☐ The defendant/contemnor gives notice of appeal from the	release the contemnor from custody unconditionally upon finding pursuant to G.S. 5A-ige condition(s) above or upon notice from a judicial official of such satisfaction.  late. If the contemnor is not sooner released, the Sheriff is hereby ORDERED to product and location below for a de novo hearing on the issue of contempt.  OURT: A person committed for civil contempt for nonpayment of a monetary obligation other than of than 90 days at one time. Recommitment is allowed only after a de novo hearing for contempt. G
Judgment of the Superior Court to the Appellate Division. Appellate entries and any conditions of post-conviction release are set forth on form AOC-CR-350.	Failure To Obey Jury Summons, G.S. 9-13. The juror is ordered to pay a fine of \$
Date Name Of Presiding Judge (type or print)	paid by (ate)  Failure To Pay Fine And/Or Costs. G.S. 15A-1364. The Court hereby orders that:
Signature Of Presiding Judge	The Court finds that the defendant is is not suitable for placement in a county satellite jail/work release unit.
CERTIFICATION	upon receipt of notice from a judicial official that the defendant has paid or satisfied the remaining obligation for the fine and costs.
I certify that this Judgment and attachment(s) marked below is a true and complete copy of the original which is on file in this case.  Appellate Entries (AOC-CR-350)	the custodian designated above shall release the defendant from custody.  The Clerk shall docket the fine of \$ and costs of \$ against the defendant as a civil judgment, G.S. 15A-1365.  but pursuant to the defendant's election to serve a sentence of imprisonment for the default, no execution may issue thereon.
otner:	ORDER OF COMMITMENT
Date Certified Copies Delivered To Sheriff	It is ordered that the Clerk deliver two certified copies of this Judgment and Commitment to the Sheriff or other qualified officer and that the officer cause the defendant/contemnor to be delivered with these copies to the custody of the agency named above to serve the
SEAL Sylvania Crossic	SIGNATURE OF JUDICIAL OFFICIAL  SIGNATURE OF JUDICIAL OFFICIAL
Deputy CSC Assistant CSC Clerk Of Superior Court	Date Name Of Presiding Judicial Official (type or print) Signature Of Presiding Judicial Official
ACC CB 219 Side Two Boy 1/23 @ 2023 Administrative Office	

## Attachment to In Re: Maness Contempt/Form AOC-CR-219

#### 1. Access as to Juvenile Records

- a. In early 2023, district court judges had badges that allowed access to almost all areas of the courthouse, including an area in the bottom floor which held the juvenile files. In order to review the juvenile files, judges could go to that floor, retrieve the files from the clerk, and review them as best fit their schedule in order to prepare for court.
- b. At some point, Honorable Todd Maness had that access revoked. Honorable Maness implemented a policy that District Court Judge's were required to use the phone beside the door for judges to call in order to be "let back" into the area with juvenile files.
- c. On more than one occasion, Honorable Beth Tanner attempted to access the files utilizing the phone unsuccessfully.
- d. After expressing a concern about this access to Honorable Maness, Honorable Beth Tanner understood that she, as a judge, could request the files be brought to her and that the Clerk's office would be available to support that request.
- e. On September 26, 2023, the undersigned judge emailed exactly that request. Exhibit A outlines the results of that email exchange, including the Clerk's refusal to deliver files to Judge Tanner's office.

## 2. Difficulties in Court Scheduling

- a. On September 12, 2023, Renee Brooks, on behalf of Todd Maness, sent an email to District Court Judges only advising that the Clerk's office would "no longer be able to accommodate any Special Hearings until further notice." In a response, Honorable Beth Tanner inquired as to how to support the Clerk's office in order to ensure the people could still have adequate court days. See Exhibit B.
- On Friday September 15, 2023, Hon. Beth Tanner had a phone call with Hon. Todd Maness which was then outlined by Judge Tanner to the District Court Judges via email. See Exhibit C.
- c. After understanding that setting days outside of what was released on the calendar by the Chief District Court Judge was presently challenging to the Clerk's office, Hon. Beth Tanner spoke with Chief Creed regarding adding an additional day of court for matters pertaining to the abuse, neglect and dependency of minor children. Pursuant to that discussion, Chief Creed added December 11, 2023 in a draft calendar which Honorable Tanner then offered as a possible day in a court session for DSS during a September session of court.
- d. Renee Brooks contacted the District Court Judges' office in September 2023, following the offering of that date by the Honorable Judge Tanner in open court, extraordinarily frustrated by court being held on December 11, 2023.
- e. Initially, the concern was a long anticipated retirement of a juvenile clerk that was some time after December 11, 2023. One day later, the concern was a doctor's appointment by a different juvenile clerk and the "newness" of a third juvenile clerk.
- f. After several conversations and a meeting with Hon. Todd Maness, Chief Creed, Hon. Beth Tanner, and Renee Brooks in September 2023, a court day was set for December

- 11, 2023. The Clerk requested that the day be "kept light" and though both judges clearly provided that it might not be possible, Honorable Beth Tanner endeavored to do so.
- g. At some point between that meeting and November 2023, the Clerk unilaterally issued a "Pending DSS Calendar" that indicated that December 11, 2023 would end at 2:30 pm. No judge set the calendar to end at 2:30 pm. In fact, the first time any judge was alerted to that need was when Honorable Beth Tanner attempted to set a case at 2pm in order to accommodate the schedule of an interpreter required for the case. Nonetheless, the "Pending DSS Calendar" with that stop time had already been published to parties involved in the cases.
- h. In addition, Honorable Beth Tanner was required to serve as a Commissioner for the North Carolina Innocence Inquiry Commission on December 7-8, 2023. As is the practice for the district, Honorable Tanner's family court coordinator contacted the most senior civil clerk (and Honorable Tanner's "usual" courtroom clerk) in order to move the scheduled matters from December 7-8, 2023 to December 21-22, 2023. However, this was not satisfactory to Honorable Maness and because simultaneously the issue had been raised as to the DSS Calendar noting a "cutoff" at 2:30 pm, Honorable Tanner addressed all the concerns in written correspondence on November 17, 2023. See Exhibit D.
- i. In order to reduce the confusion regarding the December 11, 2023 DSS date, Judge Tanner requested that the calendar be changed by a certain deadline. When the Clerk did not issue a new calendar, Honorable Beth Tanner issued an order, attached here as Exhibit E.

### 3. Organization and "Loss" of Files

- a. On more than one occasion, Honorable Beth Tanner has been alerted to medical records and mental health records that were available in the public files of civil family court matters. Some of these records were under court ordered protective order and sealed from the public record. Honorable Beth Tanner directly addressed that with one of the civil clerks.
- b. On more than one occasion, files have been "missing" at the start of court for civil court calendars. Though the files are later located, it is unclear what system is being used to keep track of the files.
- c. There has been, for some weeks, a large stack of file-stamped documents that are not filed in the court file and not entered into VCAP. This creates confusion about when dismissals have occurred or matters have been settled. In addition, on at least one occasion, a check that was provided to the clerk's office to pay court fees in late November was simply sitting in a pile of documents in the file as late as December 4, 2023.

### 4. Service Concerns

a. In one civil matter, the clerk was responsible for serving notice on the District Attorney's office as to a request for restoration of firearm rights. That notice was not served and when the case came before the Honorable Beth Tanner, this court ordered that the clerk serve notice. When the case returned some weeks later before the Honorable Beth Tanner, there was no indication proper notice had been served on the District Attorney's office. Judge Tanner issued a second order for the Clerk's office to serve proper notice. The individual seeking restoration of his rights appeared both times without resolution because proper notice had not been given to the District Attorney's office.

## 5. Failure to Follow the Court's December 4, 2023 Order:

- a. On December 4, 2023, the Clerk's office issued a second (incorrect) calendar for Honorable Tanner's family court week on NCAOC's website. As a family court district, it is the responsibility of the district court judge's staff to post the calendar. The calendar incorrectly posted by the Clerk's office held a case for Monday that was not on the "family court calendar" but the litigants appeared in the courtroom. In attempting to ascertain what was happening with that case, Honorable Beth Tanner requested the file. The courtroom clerk indicated that the file "could not be found." The file was located at some point in the morning.
- b. In order to ensure the remainder of the week's files were located, the Honorable Judge Tanner issued the order attached as *Exhibit F* requiring the files to be delivered by 4:30 pm on December 4, 2023.
- c. The files were delivered at 5:02 pm. Based on information provided by a civil clerk, the files were ready at 4:30 pm, but the civil clerks were under instructions from Honorable Todd Maness not to deliver the files as required under the order.

## 6. Failure to Follow the Court's Order December 5, 2023

a. During family court on December 5, 2023, the undersigned had need to schedule a matter on Friday December 7, 2023 at 9am. While the undersigned had previously moved the cases set for that date for responsibilities for the Innocence Inquiry Commission, the Commission's business was later able to be scheduled only on Thursday so that the undersigned could utilize the day. However, since that day was now "unscheduled" in an attempt to follow the Honorable Maness' procedure as to scheduling court, Honorable Beth Tanner requested that the courtroom clerk contact the head civil division clerk. After calling multiple times to different numbers, the courtroom clerk was unable to locate the head civil division clerk. The court took a brief recess for the courtroom clerk to locate the head civil division clerk but told the parties to remain so that the scheduling could be completed.

- b. When the recess was completed, the courtroom clerk reported that the head civil division clerk was "in the building" but could not report for reasons that the courtroom clerk did not have permission to say.
- c. The Honorable Beth Tanner then sent the courtroom bailiff for Honorable Todd Maness, indicating the possibility of direct contempt proceedings.
- d. The courtroom bailiff returned to Honorable Tanner's chambers to say that Honorable Maness sent another civil clerk "as his representative" and Honorable Maness refused to come into the courtroom himself. The representative sent by Honorable Maness was the same clerk that Judge Tanner had checked with regarding scheduling family court matters, only to be told by Honorable Maness that it was not "proper" to check with that clerk on scheduling matters so it is unclear how that "representative" was able to assist the court in scheduling on December 5, 2023.
- e. Honorable Tanner instructed the bailiff to report to Honorable Maness that she was ordering his personal appearance immediately and that he could be subject to arrest. When the bailiff reported this to Honorable Maness, Honorable Maness grabbed his coat and left the building, driving away in his vehicle.
- f. Honorable Maness returned a short time later, while Honorable Tanner was still holding court, but at no point did he report to Honorable Tanner's court.
- 7. Prior to this Show Cause Order, Honorable Beth Tanner outlined the concerns to Chief Judge Creed, Superior Court Judge Stone, and Honorable Clerk Todd Maness in an effort to alleviate the issues. Any discussions with Honorable Clerk Todd Maness were ended upon his email indicating a refusal to meet with Judge Tanner. See Exhibit G.

This the \_\_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_\_ 2023.

Beth Tanner, District Court Judge

# IN THE GENERAL COURT OF JUSTICE DISTRICT COURT DIVISION

ORDER AS TO SCHEDULING FOR DECEMBER 4, 2023 – DECEMBER 6, 2023, L.OOKE FAMILY COURT WEEK

Due to the inherent authority of the below District Court Judge to manage court scheduling for days as assigned by the Chief District Court Judge, due to the inherent authority of the below District Court Judge to manage courts within her jurisdiction, and due to the recent challenges in finding files and with calendaring of matters by the clerk's office, it is hereby ordered, adjudged and decreed:

The Clerk's Office shall present to Judge Tanner's office all files contained within the Family Court 12/05/2023 – 12/06/2023, calendar (all files listed below) by 4:30 PM today, December 4, 2023. Should Judge Tanner not be available, all files may be delivered to LaNae Davis, Family Court Coordinator, in the District Court Judge's Office.

Prior to presenting files, all outstanding filed paperwork for the below court files shall be entered by the Civil clerks in VCAP, and filed into the appropriate files. Should this not be reasonable given the time frame, the Clerk's office shall contact the undersigned in writing via email as to a reasonable timeframe to complete this requirement in the below files.

The Clerk's Office shall also remove the "second" family court calendar from the NC Courts website or take the steps to have it so removed as soon as possible so as to reduce confusion for the remainder of the week.

11CVD276, 12CVD1423, 13CVD67, 13CVD1458, 18CVD598, 18CVD1422, 20CVD1367, 21CVD458, 21CVD544, 22CVD86, 22CVD919, 22CVD1332, 22CVD1596, 23CVD25, 23CVD29, 23CVD104, 23CVD308, 23CVD381, 23CVD453, 23CVD549, 23CVD650, 23CVD742, 23CVD939, 23CVD1088, 23CVD1103, 23CVD1188, 23CVD1212, 23CVD1265, 23CVD1485, 23CVD1505

This order shall be filestamped today and a copy placed in the above referenced files. This order shall be served on the Honorable Todd Maness, the Assistant Clerk for the Civil Division, and the Chief District Court Judge by providing a copy in their courthouse box by Jennifer Kennedy.

This the 4th day of December, 2023.

HONORABLE BETH TANNER

District Court Judge, Judicial District 19D

## IN THE GENERAL COURT OF JUSTICE DISTRICT COURT DIVISION

: 2027 DEC -4 P 12: 56

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that the foregoing ORDER AS TO SCHEDULING FOR DECEMBER 4, 2023 December 6th, 2023, Family Court Week has been served upon the parties below by forwarding a copy thereof by first-class mail, postage prepaid, addressed to, the parties as follows and via email:

Shawneaka M. Jordan Personal Service (Hand delivered)

Honorable Todd Maness Personal Service (Courthouse Box)

Chief Judge Don W. Creed Personal Service (Courthouse Box)

This the 4th day of December, 2023

District Court Judge Office 19D

## IN THE GENERAL COURT OF JUSTICE DISTRICT COURT DIVISION

## ORDER AS TO SCHEDULING FOR DECEMBER 11 JUVENILE COURT ABUSE NEGLECT AND DEPENDENCY MATTERS

Due to the inherent authority of the below District Court Judge to manage court scheduling for days as assigned by the Chief District Court Judge, and due to the inherent authority of the below District Court Judge to manage courts within her jurisdiction, it is hereby ordered, adjudged and decreed:

December 11, 2023, is scheduled as a full day of court for Abuse, Neglect, Dependency matters under petition by the Moore County Department of Social Services or related matters. This is not a "special session" but is rather a session of Court within the below Judge's jurisdiction.

The Chief District Court Judge has issued a calendar assigning that day as a full day of court, the below assigned Judge has reviewed the calendar and it remains open for business as a full day of court. The day shall run from 9:30 am until at least 5:00 pm, unless more time is necessary in order to address the matters scheduled for that day. The below presiding judge will set at least one morning break, one lunch break, and one afternoon break in her discretion.

Any calendars or correspondence that indicate otherwise as to the scheduling of December 11, 2023, including previous calendars issued by the Clerk, are superseded by this Order.

This order shall be filed by the Moore County Clerk's office immediately upon receipt in the following file numbers: 17 JA 04, 23 JA 52, 23 JA 58, 23 JA 84 and any other file number that is scheduled for December 11, 2023. A copy of the filed document for each file shall be provided to the undersigned immediately after filing by providing that copy to Court Manager Jennifer Kennedy. In addition, those enumerated files shall be provided to Court Manager Jennifer Kennedy upon her request to ensure proper service on the parties as required by this Order.

This order shall be served by Court Manager Jennifer Kennedy on all attorneys in the following file numbers: 17 JA 04, 23 JA 52, 23 JA 58, 23 JA 84 via service through email and registered mail. This order shall also be served on Honorable Todd Maness by email and by personal service to his office in the Moore County Courts Facilities and by email and personal service on Renee Brooks to her office in the Moore County Courts Facilities. In addition, this order shall be served on Chief Judge Don Creed by personal service to his office in the Moore County Courts Facilities and by email.

This the 21<sup>st</sup> day of November, 2023.

HONORABLE BETH TANNER
District Court Judge, Judicial District 19D

## IN THE GENERAL COURT OF JUSTICE DISTRICT COURT DIVISION

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that the foregoing ORDER AS TO SCHEDULING FOR

DECEMBER 11 JUVENILE COURT ABUSE NEGLECT AND DEPENDENCY

MATTERS has been served upon the parties below by forwarding a copy thereof by first-class mail, postage prepaid, addressed to, the parties as follows and via email:

Cate Frederick
P.O. Box 1152
Carthage, NC 28327
cate@advocatelawnow.com

Peter Brownback 325 West Pennsylvania Ave, Suite A Southern Pines, NC 28387 brownback@mindspring.com

Sharlene Anderson P.O. Box 905 Carthage, NC 28327 sandersoni@moorecountync.gov

Renee Brooks
Personal Service (Hand delivered)
janet.r.brooks@nccourts.org

Chief Judge Don W. Creed
Personal Service (Courthouse Box)
don.w.creed@nccourts.org

This the 21st day of November, 2023

Matthew Stone
132 N. Steele St
Sanford, NC 27330
matthew@marthewstonelaw.com

William Mathers P.O. Box 1461 Carthage, NC 28327 mat-law@asheboro.com

Matthew Rothbeind P.O. Box 656 Carthage, NC 28327 mrothbeind@gmail.com

Honorable Todd Maness
Personal Service (Courthouse Box)
todd.maness@nccourts.org

Jennifer T Kennedy Court Manager II

District Court Judge Office 19D

### Tanner, Beth

From:

Tanner, Beth

Sent:

Wednesday, September 27, 2023 11:38 AM

To:

Maness, Todd; Brooks, Janet R.

Cc:

Kennedy, Jennifer T.; Creed, Don W.

Subject:

RE: File Request for Today FW: Court Calendar for Juvenile A/N/D Court on 9/28

I have always been respectful to your staff. My emails yesterday were not disrespectful in any manner. Neither was my request to have files brought to my office. It was not an "order" though orders from me as a District Court Judge over matters which I have jurisdiction are entirely proper, are not disrespectful, and are within both my statutory and constitutional duties.

As I already explained, I requested that the files be brought to my office yesterday based on the prior concerns Renee had expressed about even removing the files at all, based on my understanding of our conversation, and based on the fact that I was not, in fact, in Moore County. I was assigned in Hoke County yesterday or I would have come myself. In fact, I did come myself when I got back to Moore County, but during the course of these emails I understood I was to have several trials that would hold me in Hoke. When I received Renee's response, which did not address at all my respectful request that the files be brought to my office (and I suppose based on your logic below could be an order from Renee demanding that I retrieve the files), I explained that I understood this to be the process I was to follow and that I had spoken with you. I believe that was entirely proper, polite, and appropriate. Renee did not call Jennifer to request that someone come get the files, Renee did not explain that she was unable to work with me to provide the files to my office, and two of the juvenile clerks came to the door during this period without "working together" by bringing the files up on their way.

To suggest that I have been disrespectful to your staff is not accurate nor is it fair. When Renee requested in the past that I come downstairs to review files, etc. I did so until that became difficult for me based on the access issue. I have never felt Renee was "ordering" me, I have felt that she was making a request that I respected and in working with her, I did. Making a similar request is what I did yesterday, with the caveat that I truly believed you and/or Renee did not want me to send Jennifer down to retrieve files and that your preference was that your clerks bring files to me.

In addition, as to the November DSS calendar, the reason the day assigned to Judge Bibey right now has less cases on it is because it was, in fact, a third Thursday. Bill Mathers worked it out so that he could attend (an example of how he does that as he can), but it was not a day that was provided to Sharlene until the publication of the calendar so she did not begin scheduling cases on it until the time that the November calendar was published. It has nothing to do with the assigned judge at all, and in fact on the morning before our meeting, Sharlene provided to Renee that she would be putting some cases on that day.

In addition, based on your idea that we find a consistent day, preferably Friday when we needed extra DSS days or when we didn't have enough Thursdays, I have already spoken with all of the partners who agree that works well and Jennifer K will endeavor to respect that request as much as possible.

Thank you.

Beth T.

From: Maness, Todd

Sent: Wednesday, September 27, 2023 10:37 AM

To: Tanner, Beth < ; Brooks, Janet R.

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T.

Subject: RE: File Request for Today FW: Court Calendar for Juvenile A/N/D Court on 9/28

Dear Judge Tanner,

I've never told you that you couldn't have access to any files. The last time we texted about access was on 9/20/2023 at 8:28am. I explained that juvenile files and the money room are in my locked area. No one other than clerk staff should be in this area unless with a clerk. I respect that the Judges office area is a secure area and that neither my staff, nor myself, should enter without being invited. I explained this in great detail in my text. I advised you that if you ever need to use the Clerk's hearing room, I will absolutely do everything to accommodate you. You have used this room many times to review cases. If anything, I've given you more access to files to help you. You may send an email requesting the files you need, and they will be pulled for you. You or one of your staff may pick them up. If you are unable to reach any of my staff by phone at the door, as I advised you on 9/20/2023, call me and I will come to help you myself.

The problem with yesterday was your email ordering my staff to deliver files to your staff. I would never order your staff to do anything for myself or for my staff. We need to work together to serve the citizens to the best of our ability. I feel we need to show respect for all that work at the courthouse and the citizens by working as a team. Please respect my staff as I respect yours.

Respectfully, Todd E. Maness

From: Tanner, Beth < Sent: Tuesday, September 26, 2023 5:44 PM

To: Maness, Todd Brooks, Janet R.

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. Creed, Don W.

Subject: RE: File Request for Today FW: Court Calendar for Juvenile A/N/D Court on 9/28

Honorable Maness,

I have an extraordinary amount of respect for you and your office. It is why I work very hard to create good relationships with your clerks and with you. I simply want very much to be able to prepare for court and have enough court days to help the citizens. I can think of several specific cases where I see Emma, my Emma. People that are hurting and need help. Families who have children that look like my girl but who need help to get the support they need so they can experience the successes we've seen Emma experience. I know what it means when a child cannot communicate. I know what it feels like when you are overwhelmed by the needs of your own daughter who cannot even look at you and call you momma. I know because I lived that —I know because I remember each of those days like they were yesterday. I meant it when I told voters that I would serve those families and I do that well, even according to your own words.

As to this matter, I have an entirely different recollection of events. I tell you that only because I am truly trying to do anything I can to make my service to the people stellar using all the amazing resources, including those in your office, to do so. I was, quite literally, trying to follow one of the myriad and ever changing rules from your office about scheduling court and file access, among other topics.

I specifically expressed my concerns to you regarding access to the juvenile files some weeks ago. I explained that I when I first started as judge, I was able to access juvenile files by going downstairs with my badge and accessing the files. At the time, the "rule" was that I not remove the files from the downstairs area so I routinely utilized the clerk's courtroom when it was not in use for that review purpose. I was able to come and go as my schedule allowed. I was able to do so with little intrusion to your clerks' days and I fully respected Renee's rules.

Suddenly, and without notice to me, my access as described above to the juvenile files was removed. Nobody asked about how that might impact anyone, nobody called to find out how that would affect my preparation to serve the citizens. After several concerns with access in the basement related to being assigned to the basement courtroom and accessing the files (specifically that I could not get people to answer the phone and that I could not access the bench area of the courtroom without pulling a bailiff off their post), I addressed that concern with you. Honestly, I get it. Folks are busy in that area so truly, it is not a criticism that it was difficult to get people. You explained, as you did yesterday in our meeting about the inability to support any additional court (special sessions), that you desired to work with the judges and get us anything we needed. Heft that conversation honestly believing that your instructions were to let Renee know what files I needed and that someone would be happy to bring those to me. It was in the same conversation where you explained that if I was assigned in the basement courtroom, I would have a person that would escort me to the courtroom hallway downstairs nearest the judges' chair instead of having to enter through the crowd in the courtroom and you even indicated I would have office in the area. You also explained that the need to have the basement area restricted from access was because of instructions from NCAOC (I believe it was the auditor's office?). In any event, I fully understood, appreciated your explanation, and I believe I even said something along the lines of "hey that is all actually easier for me so if it is ok for your folks to get the files for me this is perfect." On top of that, the civil clerks bring the files to at least one other judge in our office each week as I understand it, so I honestly believed this was the practice you desired moving forward. Truly, Honorable Maness, I was simply trying to do what I thought were the prescriptive instructions related to getting files.

I just want to be prepared so that I can be the best judge for the hurting children whose cases are in front of me, asking me, and only me, to determine their best interests. That is it. I don't want power or control or fame or a dispute with the High Clerk over who walks up a set of stairs. I just want to be ready for court. In the time these emails were sent and I returned from Hoke County to go myself to get the files, two of your juvenile clerks came to the District Court Judges' office where my office was located for other matters so I really did not understand that what I was asking (1) was somehow "wrong" and (2) that it was a major issue to ask the juvenile clerk to bring the files to my office. Again, I honestly believed that is what I was supposed to do.

As to the rest of your email: Based on my training and experience, it is my understanding that the concern about emails as stated below is not correct as all emails are not in full a matter of public record. However, I am always subject to being corrected so in light of your concern, I have gotten legal advice today from NCAOC's Office of the General Counsel that makes it clear that as the judge presiding over the case, I can provide the information I need to Jennifer in order to access the files or carry out my duties to prepare for court. It was recommended that I put it in writing, which I did below, so that if there were any issues with locating files later it would be clear that it was at my direction.

Additionally, thank you for your advice on how to write emails, which I will take into consideration in the future. I was also given some instruction on email drafting when I received my law degree, additional instruction when I received my masters of law, and I was provided the opportunity to even practice what I learned during my years of experience as an attorney which included advising the largest state agency (and the largest law enforcement agency in the state) on public records law, including email. In fact, I have been the head of several litigation teams where I was in charge of entire email production projects in both state and federal court and where I was the responsible attorney over public records disclosures.

In any event, I have the files I need for Thursday now, I appreciate Renee gathering those for me in one place so quickly, and I will work through future access as each court day arises based on my own analysis of how best to move forward.

Thank you.

Beth T.

From: Maness, Todd <

Sent: Tuesday, September 26, 2023 1:43 PM

To: Tanner, Beth

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. < Subject: RE: File Request for Today FW: Court Calendar for Juvenile A/N/D Court on 9/28 Judge Tanner, I've never said that my staff would deliver files. When any of the judges need juvenile files just email the case number without a name. Please remember juvenile information is confidential and our e-mails are subject to public disclosure. Respectfully, Todd E. Maness From: Tanner, Beth Sent: Tuesday, September 26, 2023 1:27 PM To: Brooks, Janet R. Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. ; Maness, Todd < Subject: RE: File Request for Today FW: Court Calendar for Juvenile A/N/D Court on 9/28 Importance: High Please bring them up to my office. You may leave them with Jennifer. I previously spoke with Todd about the best process for this right now. I understood this was the best process and would not be an issue. I am in court in Hoke County right now. Thank you. Beth T. From: Brooks, Janet R. Sent: Tuesday, September 26, 2023 12:41 PM To: Tanner, Beth Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. < 🧰 ; Maness, Todd 🖣 Subject: RE: File Request for Today FW: Court Calendar for Juvenile A/N/D Court on 9/28 Judge Tanner, Your files are ready to be picked up.

Thank you,

Renee'

From: Tanner, Beth Sent: Tuesday, September 26, 2023 10:30 AM

To: Brooks, Janet R.

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T.

Subject: File Request for Today FW: Court Calendar for Juvenile A/N/D Court on 9/28 Importance: High
Hello!
Please deliver the following files to my office for my review this afternoon:



I am familiar with the other files so these should be all I need. Jennifer can sign anything on my behalf related to acknowledging that the files are in my office.

Thank you!

Beth T.

### Tanner, Beth

From:

Bibey, Stephen A.

Sent:

Wednesday, September 13, 2023 6:57 AM

To:

Tanner, Beth; Brooks, Janet R.; Maness, Todd; Creed, Don W.; Mcsweeney, Warren; Joe,

Regina M.

Cc:

Kennedy, Jennifer T.; Maness, Roberta B.; Carter, Kristin L.

Subject:

Re: Special Settings Of Court

I concur that as we endeavor to serve the people who placed their faith and trust in us, we should work with one another to get the courts jobs done. I too, offer my assistance to the Clerk's office and stand ready to help in any way I can. We should consider all possibilities. Respectfully and sincerely, Steve B

### Get Outlook for iOS

From: Tanner, Beth <donna.e.tanner@nccourts.org>

Sent: Tuesday, September 12, 2023 8:50:47 PM

To: Brooks, Janet R. ; Maness, Todd , Creed, Don W.

>; Mcsweeney, Warren ;; Bibey, Stephen A.

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. (Maness, Roberta B. <

Carter, Kristin L.

Subject: RE: Special Settings Of Court

#### Renee:

Thank you so much for this information. I'm hoping to find a way to support the clerk's office so we can continue to serve the people together because the courtroom clerks, including you, have always been there to support me. I could not do the work of the people without you. As you know, I am often giving away chambers days, particular for DSS cases where children have been removed from their parents. Most of the time, those children also have incredible needs. When reunification is the goal and a child's needs are not fully being met, ensuring adequate time to address that so we can serve our citizens is very important to me.

I'm so appreciative of your work with me in the juvenile courts and Sheena did an INCREDIBLE job the other day in the courtroom. I'm not surprised as she has been trained by you and Machonne! While I do not have an immediate need for a day not already outlined on the calendar, I know that many times it is in the courtroom where we identify those additional days needed. Also, since you have indicated this issue is "until further notice," I was not sure how much space the clerk's office needs to get back on track, so I wanted to start a dialogue about solutions. My goal is to think of ideas in advance so that if the need arises, we have some plans of action. I must confess, I am not well versed in the intricate workings of the clerk's office so I'm working from ideas I have seen put in place in the past and based on conversations I've had with other colleagues in other districts.

Has the Honorable Maness looked into the possibility of having relief clerks from other jurisdictions come in? I know when criminal court had personnel issues, he supported criminal courts by bringing in additional help. If so, could you provide an update as to that effort or can I support the clerk's office by contacting NCAOC directly? I understand that Director Boyce stands ready to support us.

Is it better to go ahead in the short term and "pre-plan" additional days as space holders? Though I do not have control over where I am assigned as that is a responsibility of the Chief District Court Judge, I was curious about this as a possible solution.

Also, I have learned that the current personnel issue does not impact superior court. Are there civil superior court clerks that could step in where needed?

I know that Honorable Maness is working hard to start additional courts, like treatment courts, so I'm hopeful that this will not interrupt that process as well since certainly that will require additional courtroom clerk personnel.

I'm here to support you all to the best of my ability.

Thank you!

Beth T.

From: Brooks, Janet R.

Sent: Monday, September 11, 2023 10:43 AM

To: Maness, Todd (Mcsweeney, Warren

; Joe, Regina M.

>; Tanner, Beth

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. Shaness, Roberta B.

Carter, Kristin L.

Subject: Special Settings Of Court

Hello everyone,

Please be advised that we will no longer be able to accommodate any Special Hearings until further notice. We are currently understaffed and have limited seasoned Staff available to take these Special Session Hearings. Please be patient with us while we interview for our current vacant positions and train the newly hired staff.

Thank you,

Renee'



## J. Renee' Brooks, M.L.S.

Clerk of Court Designee
Assistant Clerk of Superior Court, Juvenile Division
Language Access Coordinator
American Disabilities Act Coordinator
Moore County

North Carolina Judicial Branch

O (500 ) F 910-722-5001 (optional)

Justice for all

www.NCcourts.org



### Tanner, Beth

From:

Tanner, Beth

Sent:

Monday, September 18, 2023 10:19 AM

To:

Joe, Regina M.; Mcsweeney, Warren; Creed, Don W.; Bibey, Stephen A.

Cc:

Kennedy, Jennifer T.

Subject:

FW: Special Settings Of Court

I had a phone call with Honorable Maness on Friday related to a number of matters and he, unprompted, brought up the below issue. I believed it prudent to share it with you all so that I am fully transparent with the group.

His reasons for not having enough staff are that there have been several staff sick and/or with family needs. I explained I understood that fully and inquired as to whether these were long term issues or short term. He did not fully respond but did provide that in addition, he was understaffed by two people in civil currently but that he was hiring and also that he was chronically understaffed by one person before our district received a new district court judge seat. I will note that superior court has set a special session for two weeks in October without issue so I believe that the short term problems outlined by Renee below may be coming to a close.

I offered that requesting assistance from AOC would help him in supporting a budget revision to add positions to his office, I offered that some of these grants we were researching could also support positions for assistant clerks in his office, and I offered that should the data support additional positions for the clerk, I would be more than happy to support him with NCAOC and NCGA on that request. He did not offer any specific plans set up in his office as of yet (though, of course, that is up to him) and mentioned that other clerks had done this in other districts. When I inquired as to those districts so I could interface with some of our colleagues on how they managed those circumstances, he did not offer any more information.

I also pointed out that the long session was "almost" (hopefully) over and that budgets were set during long sessions usually so that would not come around for another two years. Honorable Maness moved on to a different topic and did not provide any further information.

My plan is to look in advance to see where I may need extra days and discuss those with Jennifer K. prior to the calendars coming out to provide ample preparation time. Outside of that, if I feel a case needs an additional day, I will set it and work with NCAOC for support for the Clerk.

I have also received a copy of the various audits done by NCAOC for the Clerks both in Moore and Hoke since 2022. If you'd like a copy, let me know.

Have a good day.

Beth T.

From: Bibey, Stephen A.

Sent: Wednesday, September 13, 2023 6:57 AM

To: Tanner, Beth Alaness, Todd

; Creed, Don W. (Mcsweeney, Warren

; Joe, Regina M.

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. Small State of the Control of the Control

Carter, Kristin L.

Subject: Re: Special Settings Of Court

I concur that as we endeavor to serve the people who placed their faith and trust in us, we should work with one another to get the courts jobs done. I too, offer my assistance to the Clerk's office and stand ready to help in any way I can. We should consider all possibilities. Respectfully and sincerely, Steve B

### Get <u>Outlook for IOS</u>

From: Tanner, Beth	The state of the s
Sent: Tuesday, September 12, 2023 8:50:47 PM	
To: Brooks, Janet R. <	; Creed, Don W.
S; Mcsweeney, Warren	; Bibey, Stephen A.
Signar M.	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. < Maness, Roberta B	
Carter, Kristin L.	
Subject: RE: Special Settings Of Court	

#### Renee:

Thank you so much for this information. I'm hoping to find a way to support the clerk's office so we can continue to serve the people together because the courtroom clerks, including you, have always been there to support me. I could not do the work of the people without you. As you know, I am often giving away chambers days, particular for DSS cases where children have been removed from their parents. Most of the time, those children also have incredible needs. When reunification is the goal and a child's needs are not fully being met, ensuring adequate time to address that so we can serve our citizens is very important to me.

I'm so appreciative of your work with me in the juvenile courts and Sheena did an INCREDIBLE job the other day in the courtroom. I'm not surprised as she has been trained by you and Machonne! While I do not have an immediate need for a day not already outlined on the calendar, I know that many times it is in the courtroom where we identify those additional days needed. Also, since you have indicated this issue is "until further notice," I was not sure how much space the clerk's office needs to get back on track, so I wanted to start a dialogue about solutions. My goal is to think of ideas in advance so that if the need arises, we have some plans of action. I must confess, I am not well versed in the intricate workings of the clerk's office so I'm working from ideas I have seen put in place in the past and based on conversations I've had with other colleagues in other districts.

Has the Honorable Maness looked into the possibility of having relief clerks from other jurisdictions come in? I know when criminal court had personnel issues, he supported criminal courts by bringing in additional help. If so, could you provide an update as to that effort or can I support the clerk's office by contacting NCAOC directly? I understand that Director Boyce stands ready to support us.

Is it better to go ahead in the short term and "pre-plan" additional days as space holders? Though I do not have control over where I am assigned as that is a responsibility of the Chief District Court Judge, I was curious about this as a possible solution.

Also, I have learned that the current personnel issue does not impact superior court. Are there civil superior court clerks that could step in where needed?

I know that Honorable Maness is working hard to start additional courts, like treatment courts, so I'm hopeful that this will not interrupt that process as well since certainly that will require additional courtroom clerk personnel.

I'm here to support you all to the best of my ability.

Thank you!

### Beth T.

From: Brooks, Janet R. 
Sent: Monday, September 11, 2023 10:43 AM
To: Maness, Todd 
; Creed, Don W.
; Mcsweeney, Warren
; Joe, Regina M.
Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. 
Carter, Kristin L.
Subject: Special Settings Of Court

Hello everyone,

Please be advised that we will no longer be able to accommodate any Special Hearings until further notice. We are currently understaffed and have limited seasoned Staff available to take these Special Session Hearings. Please be patient with us while we interview for our current vacant positions and train the newly hired staff.

Thank you,

Renee'



J. Renee' Brooks, M.L.S.

Clerk of Court Designee
Assistant Clerk of Superior Court, Juvenile Division
Language Access Coordinator
American Disabilities Act Coordinator
Moore County
North Carolina Judicial Branch
O
F 910-722-5001 (optional)

Justice for all

www.ivCcourts.org

### Tanner, Beth

From: Tanner, Beth

Sent: Friday, November 17, 2023 3:38 PM

To: Maness, Todd Cc: Creed, Don W.

Subject: FW: Judge Tanner December Family Court

I have been forwarded this email and I believe it would be important for us all to be on the same page since this issue appears to continue to come up.

- 1. My understanding of the law is that it is **not** a special session of court when I schedule court in Moore or Hoke County for any matter within the jurisdiction of the District Court. "Special Session" is a legal term of art that implies the need for the Chief Justice, the administrative office of the courts or other such official body to confer jurisdiction over a matter to a judge who would not have original jurisdiction. For example, if a visiting district court judge comes, that person is holding a "special session." If a superior court judge comes to hold a trial here who is not an elected judge here (or a special superior court judge), that is a "special session." If a retired judge holds court, that is a "special session." See Chapter 7A of the North Carolina General Statutes. Similarly, when a juvenile matter needs to be heard urgently for secured custody, that is not something on the calendar issued by Judge Creed but that does not make it a "special session." I am, of course, open to being corrected if there is a statute that suggests otherwise, but I have looked through statutes, the Court Practice Rules, and the administrative orders of which I am aware to come to this understanding.
- 2. Despite quite a bit of communication on this issue, I continue to have the concern that even after an issue is worked out with the Clerk's office, another new (and unknown) set of alleged "requirements" comes out with different hoops to jump through just to hold court. Below is an example of that happening. In DSS court yesterday, I am endeavoring to keep December 11 "light" and in fact it only has two cases, but when the translator was potentially only available at 2 pm, despite that being a full day of court, the courtroom clerk indicated that "wouldn't work" because of something related to finances that happens at 3:30pm. Because of the needs of the case and the parties, I scheduled the case at 2 pm unless a different translator can be found. Again, that is another example of where the "requirements" are now not just that it be light, but also that it be done before 3:30 pm.
- 3. I endeavor very hard to work well with all of our partners and I check in with everyone (as we did in this instance). Generally, I also give extraordinary advanced notice (again here, almost 2 months after talking with the courtroom clerk to confirm her availability). In fact, I would dare say I am the most congenial of the judges when it comes to working around schedules. However, when I am scheduling court or moving assigned matters to different days, I am not asking for permission. I am scheduling court.
- 4. I have also checked in with my colleagues who have a similar practice to me and they have not received similar emails so I am curious why I am being singled out as it relates to this issue. To my knowledge, and based on my communication with my colleagues, you also haven't sent any correspondence to any other judges, including the superior court judges, to share any of these new requests you have made.

I will continue forward, again taking into account this new request you've made, to continue doing my best to work well with the Clerk's office. I have copied Judge Creed as well given his authority in NCGS 7A-146(3).

Thank you!

Beth T.

Exhibito



Beth Tanner, J.D., LL.M District Court Judge Judicial District 19D, Moore and Hoke North Carolina Judicial Branch

F 910-722-5013

Justice for all
www.NCcourts.gov



From: Maness, Todd

Sent: Friday, November 17, 2023 12:18 PM

To: Davis, Lanae M. Shawneaka M

L. <

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. < ; Love, Kailen E.

Subject: RE: Judge Tanner December Family Court

Lanae,

I have checked with Shawneaka Jordan, Assistant over the Civil Department, regarding the 2 Special Sessions of Court Judge Tanner is wanting to schedule.

Ms. Jordan informed me that there are enough ladies to cover this session and cover the Department, as well. So, we will be able to accommodate your request.

Please make certain in the future that the Assistant over the Department is asked before an additional Special Session is calendared outside the Regular Calendar to make certain we have enough ladies to cover Special Sessions of Court and to cover the Department as well.

Respectfully,

Todd E. Maness

From: Davis, Lanae M.

Sent: Friday, November 3, 2023 11:35 AM

To: Maness, Todd , Ndoye, Amanda G. , Jordan,

Shawneaka M. Carter, Kristin

L.

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. Special Science Scien

Subject: RE: Judge Tanner December Family Court

Good morning,

Thank you very much. We completely understand. As Amanda typically clerks for Judge Tanner, I did make sure she was available, and she has marked her calendar. Please let us know if there are any conflicts.

Thanks again!!

From: Maness, Todd 
Sent: Friday, November 3, 2023 11:29 AM

To: Davis, Lanae M. 
Shawneaka M. 
Shawneaka M. 
Stanae, 
Stanae, 
Sent: Friday, November 3, 2023 11:29 AM

Stanae, Shawneaka M. 
Stanae,

I appreciate Judge Tanner giving up her chambers days to hear cases that she had to postpone from her regularly scheduled session previously calendared.

However, I will have to check and see if we have a clerk available for December 21<sup>st</sup> and December 22<sup>nd</sup>. That is near the Christmas Holiday and we might have ladies scheduled to be off for vacation, to be with their families.

Thank you for checking on our Clerk availability and I will let you know as soon as possible.

Respectfully,

Todd E. Maness

From: Davis, Lanae M. 
Sent: Thursday, November 2, 2023 4:31 PM

To: Ndoye, Amanda G. 

Sprady, Jennifer D. 

Cc: Kennedy, Jennifer T. 

Subject: Judge Tanner December Family Court

Good afternoon,

I hope you are well.

Please note, Judge Tanner's presence is needed in a meeting on December 7<sup>th</sup> and December 8<sup>th</sup>, and she will not be holding family court these days. Judge Tanner has graciously given up a couple of her chamber days to reschedule the cases that were to be heard on these dates. Judge Tanner will be holding family court on December 21<sup>st</sup> and December 22<sup>nd</sup>. Please note these dates on your calendar.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thank you so much, and I hope you have a great day!



## LaNae Davis

Court Coordinator District Court Judge's Office Judicial District 19D North Carolina Judicial Branch Moore County

F 910-722-5013

Justice for all www.NCcourts.gov







## Kennedy, Jennifer T.

From:

Maness, Todd

Sent:

Monday, November 27, 2023 10:07 AM

To: Subject:

Kennedy, Jennifer T. RE: Meeting next week

Good Morning,

There will not be a meeting with Judge Tanner.

Respectfully, Todd E. Maness

From: Kennedy, Jennifer T.

Sent: Wednesday, November 22, 2023 1:28 PM

To: Maness, Todd

Cc: Tanner, Beth ; Creed, Don W.

Subject: Meeting next week

Good Afternoon,

It is my understanding you have attempted to reach out to both Judge Creed and Judge Tanner to discuss Judge Tanner's Order, filed yesterday, as well as to discuss court scheduling.

Judge Creed and Judge Tanner are both available to meet with you next Monday, November  $27^{th}$ , between 3:30pm-5:00pm. Please let me know time works best for you during that timeframe.

Sincerely,



Jennifer T. Kennedy

Court Manager II
District Court Judge's Office
Judicial District 19D

North Carolina Judicial Branch

F 910-722-5013

Justice for all www.NCcourts.gov

